

Kentaro Kawai

Dr. Senaha

Scholar and Scholarship I

20 August 2003

## Annotated Bibliography: Dickens and Thackeray

### Introduction

As David Masson asserted in 1851 that "Thackeray and Dickens, Dickens and Thackeray the two names almost now necessarily go together," Charles Dickens and William Makepeace Thackeray were the two leading novelists of the time. They wrote and published their works periodically, and as if they were competing, their works were issued concurrently for fifteen years; for example, Vanity Fair (1847-1848) with Dombey and Son (1846-1848), Pendennis (1848-1850) with David Copperfield (1849-1850), and so forth.

The purpose of this project is to know each novelist's priorities in writing novels through their criticisms for the works of one another. I compile the letters, speeches, essays, reviews, works, and other writings in which they express their opinions for the counterpart's works. In addition, to supplement those materials, I collect writings by other people which reveals Dickens' or Thackeray's opinions to the works of each other. The scholarly papers, articles, books, or researches that discuss the intertextual relationship between these two writers are also collected. Because of the purpose I mentioned above, I exclude this time the criticism which just compare both writers and do not treat the influence or intertextual relationship.

For searching books and articles, I used these bibliographies: "Victorian Bibliography for [1932- ]" in Victorian Studies and its reprints, MLA International Bibliography, Dissertation Abstracts International, The New Cambridge Bibliography of English Literature vol. 3, Index to British Literary Bibliography vol. 5, Wellesley Index to Victorian Periodicals, 1824-1900.

I used republished compilations for some materials. As for letters, I used Letters of Charles Dickens by Madeline House and Graham Storey, The Letters and Private Papers of William Makepeace Thackeray by Gordon N. Ray, and its supplement by Edgar H. Harden. They are thorough and authentic multi-volume works. I used The Speeches of Charles Dickens: A Complete Edition by K. J. Fielding for speeches, and likewise, for other primary materials, if there are trustworthy republications, I used them.

A period covered is from 1838 to the present since there is no bibliography like this. Therefore, we can see the first letter of Thackeray mentioning Dickens' works and the latest survey that discusses Dickens' complaint against Thackeray. As regards annotation for letters, I cite the original sentences if they are short and seem to be better than I explain in other words. There are many letters which include only one or two sentences concerning my interest in this project, therefore I think it is better to cite whole of those sentences in annotations.

Generally, Thackeray had read Dickens' books eagerly and expressed his feelings many times. On the other hand, Dickens seems not to have read Thackeray's novels so much and rarely expressed his opinions for them. Both novelists were consistent in their criticisms: Thackeray considered Dickens' novels were not 'real' and 'natural,' and Dickens considered some of Thackeray's novels made light of literature and literary man. But at the same time, Thackeray liked

some of Dickens' works very much and recognized his power of imagination. Dickens also praised some of Thackeray's novel, however, he objected Thackeray's criticism for him by insisting it is not matter to be seen natural or not.

As for Criticism, since 1896, there have been nearly 20 articles that discuss the textual relationships between two novelists, such as comparing DC and Pendennis, OT and Catherine, or PP and YP. Except for them, Harry Stone wrote Dickens' Knowledge of Thackeray's Writings in 1957 and changed the image that Dickens didn't read Thackeray's novel at all. Nine years later, Charles Mauskopf's Thackeray's Attitude toward Dickens's Writings was published. This article is a minute study of Thackeray's opinions for many works of Dickens. These two papers would be the best to know these novelists' fundamental views for one another's works. Recently, Mark W. Cronin writes four papers concerning this matter. The most comprehensive one is Textual Relationship between the Fictions of Charles Dickens and William Makepeace Thackeray, which Cronin deals more than ten novels by both authors.

## Abbreviations

### Works of Charles Dickens

AN = American Notes

BH = Bleak House

BL = The Battle of Life

BR = Barnaby Rudge

CB = Christmas Books

CC = Christmas Carol

CH = Cricket on the Hearth

DC = David Copperfield

DS = Dombey and Son

HM = Haunted Man

LD = Little Dorrit

MHC = Master Humphrey's Clock

NN = Nicholas Nickleby

OT = Oliver Twist

PP = The Pickwick Papers

### Works of William Makepeace Thackeray

CW = The Curate's Walk

YP = Yellowplush Papers

VF = Vanity Fair

### Others

DAI = Dissertation Abstracts International

Dickensian = The Dickensian

DQu = Dickens Quarterly

DSA = Dickens Studies Annual

FM = Fraser's Magazine

JNT = The Journal of Narrative Technique

NBR = North British Review

NCF = Nineteenth-Century Fiction

Letters of Dickens = Letters of Charles Dickens

Letters of Thackeray = The Letters and Private Papers of William

Makepeace Thackeray

Supp. Letters of Thackeray = The Letters and Private Papers of William

Makepeace Thackeray: A Supplement to Gordon N. Ray, The Letters and

Private Papers of William Makepeace Thackeray

SEL = Studies in English Literature

## Primary Sources

- (1) Thackeray, William Makepeace. "Half a Crown's Worth of Cheap Knowledge." FM 17 (1838): 279-290.

A review of the novels in cheap periodicals. Comparing OT with "Oliver Twiss by Bos," T calls OT "Boz's admirable tale."

- (2) ---. "To Richard Bentley." 19 November 1838. Letter 128C of Supp. Letters of Thackeray. Ed. Edgar F. Harden. Vol. 1 New York: Garland, 1994. 38-39.

A letter which mentions OT and BR. "The last part of O[liver] twist is I think as fine as anything in any story ancient or modern. With my best respects and wishes for Barnaby Rudge."

- (3) ---. "Horæ Catnachianæ." FM 19 (1839): 407-424.

An essay which criticizes OT and other Newgate novels, pointing their lack of reality. T considers the Newgate novelists (including CD) never spent a time with low lives though they describe them in their works. In addition, the materials used in the works "mislead the public," T asserts, because novelists should not show the attractive thieves or cut-throats to the readers.

- (4) ---. Catherine: A Story. Ed. Sheldon F. Goldfarb. Ann Arbor: U of Michigan

P, 1999.

Anti-Newgate novel. Refers to OT many times, especially in "another last chapter." The power of CD is so amazing, T writes, so readers are forced to watch succeeding crimes or errors of the characters. "The whole London public...were interested about a set of ruffians whose occupations are thievery, murder, and prostitution." Cautions readers not to expend their sympathies on cutthroats. (7)

- (5) ---. "A Pictorial Rhapsody." FM 22 (1840). Rpt. in Works of William Makepeace Thackeray. Vol. 25. London: Smith, 1885.

Expresses passionate worship for CD. "Long mayest thou, O Boz! reign over thy comic kingdom...Mighty prince! at thy imperial feet, Titmarsh [Thackeray], humblest of thy servants, offers his vows of loyalty, and his humble tribute of praise."

- (6) ---. "Going to See a Man Hanged." FM 22 (1840): 154-155. Rpt. in The Works of William Makepeace Thackeray Intro. Lady Ritchie. Vol. 26. New York: Ams P, 1968.

An essay that mentions Nancy of OT. Seeing girls with young blackguards and thieves, T considered CD might have taken a study for Nancy from them. In spite of their low circumstances, he finds something good about the girl and says, "Boz, who knows life well, knows that his Miss Nancy is

the most unreal fantastical personage possible."

- (7) Dickens, Charles. "To R. H. Horne." February 1840. Letters of Dickens. Ed.

Madeline House and Graham Storey. Vol. 2. Frome: Oxford UP, 1969. 20-21.

A complains letter that he is charged by some "jolter-headed enemies (presumably referring T who criticised OT in Catherine)." CD says he shall take an early opportunity of temperately replying, and his reply appeared next year, in the preface for the third edition of OT. (4) (11)

- (8) Thackeray, William Makepeace. "To Mrs. Carmichael-Smith." April 1840.

Letter 160 of Letters of Thackeray. 1945. Ed. Gordon, N. Ray. Vol. 1. New York: Octagon, 1980. 436-439.

Mentions the first number of MHC. "It is dull", he writes, "but somehow gives one a very pleasing impression of the man: a noble tender-hearted creature, who sympathizes with all the human race."

- (9) ---. "To Mrs. Carmichael-Smith." May 1840. Letter 162 of Letters of

Thackeray. 1945. Ed. Gordon, N. Ray. Vol. 1. New York: Octagon, 1980. 442-445.

Mentions the second number of MHC in short. "Dickens is sadly flat, with his Old Clock: but still sells 50000."



- (10) ---. Paris Sketch Book. Rpt. in Dickens: The critical Heritage. Ed. Philip Collins. London: Routledge, 1971.

Mentions CD, and compares him with Smollet and Fielding: Roderick Random is inferior to PP, and Tom Jones immeasurably superior. PP contains true character under false names, he says, and gives "a better idea of the state and ways of the people than one could gather from any more pompous or authentic histories."

- (11) Dickens, Charles. "Preface to the Third Edition." Oliver Twist. 1841. Ed. Kathleen Tillotson. Glasgow: Oxford UP, 1974.

Reply to the criticism against OT, including T's. Insists a lesson of the purest good can be drawn from the vilest evil, and believes this to be a recognized and established truth. Also, "It is useless to discuss whether the conduct and character of the girl seems natural or unnatural, probable or improbable, right or wrong. IT IS TRUE." (7)

- (12) Thackeray, William Makepeace. "Dickens in France." 1842. Rpt. in The Works of William Makepeace Thackeray Intro. Lady Ritchie. Vol. 26. New York: Ams P, 1968.

Contradiction to the review of NN by Jules Janin, French critic. Denounces Janin for criticising NN, only by adapted French play. T notices Janin didn't read CD's original book, and says, "what right have you,

O blundering ignoramus!"

- (13) ---. "To Mrs. Carmichael-Smith." 28 October 1842. Letter 234 of Letters of Thackeray. 1945. Ed. Gordon, N. Ray. Vol. 2. New York: Octagon, 1980. 88-89.

Mentions AN. Hopes his book will amuse people (that is all he asks) and AN may help him. "Dickens's new book wh[ich] all the world is talking about will in so far help me, as people who have read that & liked it will like more reading of the same sort."

- (14) ---. "To Mrs. Carmichael-Smyth." 20 May 1843. Letter 253 of Letters of Thackeray. 1945. Ed. Gordon, N. Ray. Vol. 2. New York: Octagon, 1980. 112-113.

Refers briefly to CD's review of Irish Sketch Book. "Boz has written me a letter of compliments." T had been anxious for the success of it and asked many friends, including CD, to review it.

- (15) ---. "To His Family" 17-18 December 1843. Letter 270 of Letters of Thackeray. 1945. Ed. Gordon, N. Ray. Vol. 2. New York: Octagon, 1980. 134-136.

Simply comments for CC, "a charming Christmas book, wh[ich] I won't forget to bring with me...Why not be merry when one can?"

(16) ---. "To Mrs. Thackeray." 11 March 1844. Letter 281 of Letters of

Thackeray. Ed. Gordon, N. Ray. Vol. 2. New York: Octagon, 1980. 164-166.

Mentions undiscovered letter from CD, presumably appreciates T's review of CC in FM. "Boz writes that my notice of him has touched him to the quick encouraged him and done him good." (18)

(17) ---. "To Mrs. Carmichael-Smyth" 17 September 1844. Letter 297 of Letters

of Thackeray. 1945. Ed. Gordon, N. Ray. Vol. 2. New York: Octagon, 1980. 183-184.

T ends this letter with " and God bless you every one," a famous phrase of Tiny Tim in CC.

(18) ---. "A Box of Novels." FM 29 (1844): 166-169.

Extols CD, comparing him with great English writers. CD gives people the harmless laughter, the generous wit, the frank, manly, human love, T tells. Especially, raves about CC that no sceptic and no critic could review it down. "It seems to me a national benefit," he writes, and praises its power to move people to celebrate Christmas. (16)

(19) ---. "Christmas Books. No. 1." Morning Chronicle 24 December 1845. Rpt.

in Thackeray's Contributions to the Morning Chronicle. Ed. Gordon N. Ray.

Urbana: U of Illinois P, 1955.

Review of CH. Calls CD as "chief literary master of the ceremonies for Christmas," and praises his kindness, joviality and pathos of the season while repeatedly tells CH's unreality. But T advises readers must reconcile themselves to its tone and believe that the book is a Christmas frolic. (21)

(20) ---. "To Mrs. Carmichael-Smith." 23 December 1846. Letter 361 of Letters of Thackeray. 1945. Ed. Gordon, N. Ray. Vol. 2. New York: Octagon, 1980. 257-258.

Compares his "great success," Mrs. Perkins Ball with CD's BL. "Mrs. Perkins is a great success the greatest I have had very nearly as great as Dickens. that is Perkins 500 Dickens 25000 only that difference!"

(21) ---. "A Grumbles about Christmas Book." FM 35 (1847):111-126.

Discusses BL and CH. Although complains they are not "true" and "natural" as per usual, he perceives CH is not intended to be so. "The poet does not want you to believe him, he wants to provoke your mirth and wonder" he writes, referring to his own review of CH written two years before. (19)

(22) ---. "To William Edmondstoune Aytoun." 2 January 1847. Letter 366 of

Supp. Letters of Thackeray. Ed. Edgar F. Harden. Vol. 1. New York: Garland, 1994. 186-188.

Simply mentions the scathing review of BL in The Times of January 2. He writes, "Appy Dickens! But I love Pickwick and Crummles too well to abuse this great man. Aliquando bonus [sometimes nods]."

(23) Dickens, Charles. "To John Forster." 9 June 1847. Letter 397 of Letters of Thackeray. 1945. Ed. Gordon, N. Ray. Vol. 2. New York: Octagon, 1980. 297-298.

Expresses his opinion about T's "Imitation in Punch," Novels by Eminent Hands. "I had a strong opinion of my own: and that it was that they did no honor to literature or literary men, and should be left to very inferior and miserable hands." CD tells this is what he desires T to know.

(24) Thackeray, William Makepeace. "To Mrs. Carmichael-Smith." 7 January 1848. Letter 436 of Letters of Thackeray. 1945. Ed. Gordon, N. Ray. Vol. 2. New York: Octagon, 1980. 333-335.

Mentions CD. "I am become a sort of great man in my way all but at the top of the tree: indeed there if the truth were known and having a great fight up there with Dickens," he writes.

(25) Dickens, Charles. "To William Makepeace Thackeray." 9 January 1848.

Letters of Dickens. Ed. Graham Storey and K. J. Fielding. Vol. 5. New York: Oxford UP, 1981. 227-228.

Appreciates T's undiscovered letter, presumably, in which T praises DS. CD confesses he doesn't peruse VF because he has to write DS. But celebrates CW, "I cried most bitterly over your affecting picture...and shall never forget it." Years later he mentions CW again in In Memoriam, as "his very best contribution to Punch." (54)

(26) Thackeray, William Makepeace. "To Mrs. Brookfield." 21 December 1848.

Letter 543 of Letters of Thackeray. 1945. Ed. Gordon, N. Ray. Vol. 2. New York: Octagon, 1980. 469-471.

Mentions HM briefly, "there is a bit at the end about a little dead child which is very touching." Three days before, he sends two letters and a copy of HM to Mrs. Brookfield. There he tells that he buys another HM for the other person, and that he read it first 20 pages, while his mother read it and was very much moved. Asks Mrs. Brookfield to return the book next year.

(27) ---. "To Mrs. Brookfield." 4 May 1849. Letter 586 of Letters of Thackeray.

1945. Ed. Gordon, N. Ray. Vol. 2. New York: Octagon, 1980. 530-532.

Gives a great praise for DC. "Bravo Dickens. It has some of his very prettiest touches those inimitable Dickens touches wh[ich] make such a

great man of him," and T insists it is improved by taking a lesson from VF, that CD simplified his style and kept out of the fine words.

(28) ---. "To The Rev. William Brookfield." May 1849. Letter 587 of Letters of Thackeray. 1945. Ed. Gordon, N. Ray. Vol. 2. New York: Octagon, 1980. 533.

T applauds DC again, in a short comment this time, but admits his defeat. "Get David Copperfield: by Jingo it's beautiful it beats the yellow chap of this month hollow." Yellow chap here refers Pendennis.

(29) ---. "To Lady Blessington." 6 May 1849. Letter 588 of Letters of Thackeray. 1945. Ed. Gordon, N. Ray. Vol. 2. New York: Octagon, 1980. 533-535.

Praises DC. Again he writes "Bravo Dickens!" and "it has beautiful things in it those sweet little inimitable bits." T tells he is glad, that CD has been reading his novel and changed his style. "In fact [Dickens] is doing his best," he writes.

(30) ---. "To Mrs. Brookfield." 4-6 September 1849. Letter 625 of Letters of Thackeray. 1945. Ed. Gordon, N. Ray. Vol. 2. New York: Octagon, 1980. 586-590.

Gives very short comment to DC. Tells there's "a charming bit of insanity" in it and he began to believe "the very best thing the author has yet done." According to Ray, the "charming bit of insanity" is Mr. Dick who appears in

chapter 13.

- (31) ---. "To Mrs. Brookfield." 1-2 March 1850. Letter 687 of Letters of Thackeray. 1945. Ed. Gordon, N. Ray. Vol. 2. New York: Octagon, 1980. 646-648.

Mentions DC. Writes "Boz is capital this month some very neat pretty natural writing indeed better than somebody else again. By Jove he is a clever fellow, and somebody else must and shall do better."

- (32) ---. "To Mrs. Edward John Sartoris." October-November 1850. Letter 772 of Supp. Letters of Thackeray. Ed. Edgar F. Harden. Vol. 1. New York: Garland, 1994. 380-384.

Refers DC and calls it as "the artless rogue! that artless dodge makes me laugh (is it only wicked things that make one laugh any more?)."

- (33) ---. "To David Masson." 6(?) May 1851. Letter 772 of Supp. Letters of Thackeray. Ed. Edgar F. Harden. Vol. 1. New York: Garland, 1994. 410-411.

Appreciates to Masson's review in NBR. Praises CD at first, "his songs are so delightful and admirable," that he never thought to try to imitate CD. However, follows "I quarrel with his Art in many respects: wh[ich] I don't think represents Nature duly." At the end of the letter, he again commends for CD that his writing has one admirable quality that answers



everything.

(34) Dickens, Charles. "To David Masson." 9 May 1851. Letters of Dickens. Ed.

Graham Storey, Kathleen Tillotson, and Nina Burgis. Vol. 6. New York: Oxford UP, 1988. 381.

Reply to Masson's review in NBR. "I am truly gratified by the praise which is so eloquently and thoughtfully bestowed," and tells Masson's review had given CD the great satisfaction.

(35) Thackeray, William Makepeace. "To Richard Pryme." 15 February 1852.

Letter 823 of Letters of Thackeray. 1946. Ed. Gordon, N. Ray. Vol. 3. New York: Octagon, 1980. 10.

Refers CD and his poem. "Mr. Dickens was very young and unlettered when he wrote the 'Ivy Green,' though a prodigious genius as I needn't tell you who know it." Ivy Green is a poem recited by an old clergyman in PP.

(36) ---. Lecture. "Charity and Humour." New York. The Works of William

Makepeace Thackeray. Vol. 25. London: Smith, 1885.

A lecture first delivered in NY in 1852, and subsequently repeated with slight different form in London. T praises CD very much, especially CC and NN. CC is the best charity sermon ever preached in the world, he says, but at last, "I may quarrel with Mr. Dickens's art a thousand and a

thousand times, I delight and wonder at his genius." (44) (45)

- (37) ---. "To Lady Stanley." 21 January 1853. Letter 937 of Letters of Thackeray. 1946. Ed. Gordon, N. Ray. Vol. 3. New York: Octagon, 1980. 178-182.

An only sentence appears in the letter: "Dickens's last number of Bleak House is a failure."

- (38) ---. "To Albany Fonblanque." 4 March 1853. Letter 962 of Supp. Letters of Thackeray. Ed. Edgar F. Harden. Vol. 1. New York: Garland, 1994. 542-546.

Mentions AN, and criticises its unreality. Insists no man should write about a country under five years of experience. Complaining about the descriptions of Broadway and so forth, "O Lord is that describing America? It's a mole or pimple on the great Republican body," he writes.

- (39) ---. "To Mrs. Baxter." 12 March 1853. Letter 966 of Supp. Letters of Thackeray. Ed. Edgar F. Harden. Vol. 1. New York: Garland, 1994. 549-551.

Uses a character's name of BH, "I can sit on the sofa as easy as the Professor of Department in Bleak House." "Professor of Department" refers Mr. Turveydrop. T uses the same name again in his letter to Mrs. Procter on April 4 (Letters of Thackeray Vol. 3. pp. 250-252).

- (40) ---. "To Mrs. Carmichael-Smith." 18 July 1853. Letter 995 of Letters of Thackeray. 1946. Ed. Gordon, N. Ray. Vol. 3. New York: Octagon, 1980. 287-289.

Mentions CD's imagination. "One of his immense superiorities over me is the great fecundity of his imagination," he writes, "He has written 10 books and lo I am worn out after two."

- (41) ---. The English Humourists of the Eighteenth Century. 1853. Ed. C. B. Wheeler. Rev. ed. London: Oxford UP, 1916.

In "Lecture the Six: Sterne and Goldsmith," mentions CD "I think of these past writers and of one who lives amongst us now, and am grateful for the innocent laughter and the sweet and unsullied page which the author of *David Copperfield* gives to my children."

- (42) ---. "To John Blackwood" 30 December 1854. Letter 1085 of Letters of Thackeray. 1946. Ed. Gordon, N. Ray. Vol. 3. New York: Octagon, 1980. 406-408.

Calls CD "genius" when he complains about reviewer of Blackwood's Magazine. He insists, about its order of novelists, "I think put Dickens first, as undoubtedly the greatest *genius* of the three." Those three men are T, Bulwer-Lytton whom the critic regards as the greatest novelist of the day, and CD.

(43) ---. "To Dr. and Mrs. Brown." 31 December 1854. Letter 1086 of Supp.

Letters of Thackeray. Ed. Edgar F. Harden. Vol. 1. New York: Garland, 1994. 665-666.

Shows same complaint as the letter to Blackwood. "I don't believe Bulwer is the first of that triumvirate the reviewer talks of. I think Dickens is." But at the same time, he confesses he doesn't read CD of late. However, thinking back of him, T thinks "he's a greatest *genius* of the three."

(44) Dickens, Charles. "To William Makepeace Thackeray." 23 March 1855.

Letters of Dickens. Ed. Graham Storey, Kathleen Tillotson and Angus Easson. Vol. 7. New York: Oxford UP, 1993. 575.

A response to T's lecture, "Charity and Humour," delivered at the Marylebone Institution. The Times tells T calls CD as "a person commissioned by Divine Providence to correct and instruct his fellow-men," and CD read this and appreciates, saying he was profoundly touched by T's generous reference for him and shall never forget the words of commendation. (36)

(45) ---. "To William Makepeace Thackeray." 26 March 1855. Letters of Dickens.

Ed. Graham Storey, Kathleen Tillotson and Angus Easson. Vol. 7. New York: Oxford UP, 1993. 578.

Appreciates again for, probably, T's "Charity and Humour" lecture. "Many thanks for the extract. You say it is not much, but I think it *is* very much and I have read it with great emotion." CD didn't listen but "read" the lecture on The Times's report. (36)

(46) Thackeray, William Makepeace. "To Mrs. Bryan Waller Procter." 14-18

December 1855. Letter 1183 of Supp. Letters of Thackeray. 1946. Ed. Edgar F. Harden. Vol. 1. New York: Garland, 1994. 718-720.

Briefly mentions LD. "I read little Dorrit...and thought chapters III & IV a famous preface didn[']t like the elaboration of the first part."

(47) ---. "To Anne and Harriet Thackeray." 22-24 February 1856. Letter 1215 of

Letters of Thackeray. 1946. Ed. Gordon, N. Ray. Vol. 3. New York: Octagon, 1980. 571-573.

Praises LD. After telling he'll be worth 10000 pounds at midsummer, he writes, "I think little Dorrit capital as far as I have read...I was thinking to myself how much is Dickens worth?"

(48) ---. "To Amy Crowe." November 1856. Letter 1260C of Supp. Letters of

Thackeray. Ed Edgar F. Harden. Vol. 1. New York: Garland, 1994. 760-761.

Begins with "My dear little Dorrit." Writes "I don[']t know a woman in all the world I could live with except little Dorrit."

(49) Mrs. Elwins. "Thackeray in Norwich, May, 1857." Some Eighteenth

Century Men of Letters. Rpt. in Letters of Thackeray. Ed. Gordon N. Ray.  
Vol. 4. Appendix 18. New York: Octagon, 1980.

A recollection includes the story of T's liking for Peggotty in DC. He wished to go to Yarmouth and said "I want to see the Great Ocean; I want to see where Peggotty lived."

(50) Thackeray, William Makepeace. Speech. Royal General Theatrical Fund.

29 March 1858. The Speeches of Charles Dickens: A Complete Edition. Ed. K. J. Fielding. Harvester: Humanities P, 1988.

Gives graceful reference to CD. Tells his regret that he doesn't have "that happy genius and skill for the post which belongs to a friend of mine." After CD's speech, he made another short speech for it, expressing great thankfulness, in a voice broken by emotion.

(51) Dickens, Charles. Speech. Royal General Theatrical Fund. 29 March 1858.

The Speeches of Charles Dickens: A Complete Edition. Ed. K. J. Fielding. Harvester: Humanities P, 1988.

Praises T, mentioning VF. T's books are full of wit, wisdom, and outspoken meaning, he says, and yet, though out-speaking, "how devoid of fear, and how devoid of favour." He says VF has greater advantage, profit,

and contentment than any theatre, and calls T as "this skillful showman, who has so much delighted us."

- (52) Thackeray, William Makepeace. Speech. Royal Academy Banquet. 1 May 1858. The Speeches of Charles Dickens: A Complete Edition. Ed. K. J. Fielding. Harvester: Humanities P, 1988.

Recalls his first meeting with CD, and confesses CD's refusal motivated him to work hard to be admitted in the literary world. "But for that unfortunate blight...it would have been my pride and pleasure to have endeavoured one day to find a place on these walls for one of my performances."

- (53) ---. "To George Smith." December 1860. Letter 1481G of Supp. Letters of Thackeray. Ed Edgar F. Harden. Vol. 2. New York: Garland, 1994. 1007.

Mentions Philip of Great Expectations in a very short letter. "As the posters are out, let Philip stand and see if we can[']t make a good fight against tother Philip."

- (54) Dickens, Charles. "In Memoriam." Cornhill Magazine 9 (1864): 129-132. Rpt. in Thackeray the Humourist and the Man of Letters. 1864. Ed. Theodore Taylor. New York: Haskell, 1971.

An eulogy to T. Confesses they had different opinion: he thought T was too

much feigned a want of earnestness. But praises his "refined knowledge of character," "subtle acquaintance with the weaknesses of human nature," "delightful playfulness as an essayist," "quaint and touching ballads," and "mastery over the English language." Mentions and speaks highly of Denis Duval. (25)

- (55) Hodder, George. Memoirs of my Time. London, 1870. Rpt. in Anecdote Biographies of Thackeray and Dickens Ed. Richard Henry Stoddard: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1874.

Tells T's admiration for DS. T hastened into the editor's room of Punch, putting number five of DS in his pocket, and exclaimed with startling vehemence. "There's no writing against such power as this one has no chance!" he said, "Read that chapter describing young Paul's death: it is unsurpassed it is stupendous!"

- (56) Lippincott A. Z. "Some Recollections of Thackeray." Lippincott's Magazine 7 (1871): 106-110. Rpt. in Anecdote Biographies of Thackeray and Dickens Ed. Richard Henry Stoddard. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1874.

Tells T talked about CD's literary genius and his incomes. T added, "he doesn't like me: he knows that my books are a protest against his that if one set are true, the other must be false. But *Pickwick* is an exception: it is a capital book."



(57) Yates, Edmund. Edmund Yates: His Recollections and Experiences.

London: Bentley, 1885. Rpt. in Thackeray: Interviews and Recollections  
Ed. Philip Collins. London: MacMillan P, 1983.

Includes his recollections of T. Tells when he was speaking of a certain review of LD, T said with half-humorous and half-serious look, "though, between ourselves, my dear Yates, *Little D.* is Deed stupid." Also tells CD read little and thought less of T's later work.

#### Criticism

(58) "Who Was the Imitator Dickens or Thackeray?" Atlantic Monthly 78

(1896): 139-141.

Discusses many similarities and possible influences between DC and Pendennis. Noticing parallel story of both heroes' love story, the writer finds the different point of views of CD and T. In conclusion, he asserts T was the imitator because CD had already made his reputation and was unwilling to risk it.

(59) Williams, Charles Riddell. "The Personal Relations of Dickens and

Thackeray." Dickensian 36 (1939): 75-91.

Mainly describes the personal relations of both novelists, but includes their

opinions for one another's works. Williams introduces and notes T's opinions for DC, CC, NN and so on, and CD's speech delivered at General Theatrical Fund. Although there are many stories and gossips that T was jealous of CD, he examines these and concludes there is really nothing in them.

(60) Pearson, Hesketh. Dickens: His Character, Comedy, and Career. London:

Methuen, 1949.

Describes some relationship between CD and T, and Pearson first connected LD's Henry Gowan with T. Tells T called LD "dead stupid" and "damned rot" because he must have perceived that Gowan contained CD's opinion of T: "habit of blowing hot and cold" and "way of interspersing cynical comments on life with enthusiastic appreciation of it."

(61) Ray, Gordon N. Thackeray: The Uses of Adversity 1811-1846. 1955. New

York: Octagon, 1972.

A comprehensive biography of T, which includes his opinions for CD's works. Treats T's reviews of CC and CH, fondness for DC, admiration for DS, objection for French criticism of NN, and so on. Each are demonstrated with good citations and Ray's note.

(62) Stone, Harry. "Dickens's Knowledge of Thackeray's Writings." Dickensian

53.1 (1957): 42-45.

Examines C. R. Williams' 1939 theory, "no evidence that Dickens read any of Thackeray's books at all," considered authoritative at that time. Exemplifying T's works in CD's library, CD's mentions to T's other works, and In Memoriam, Stone concludes CD must have read T, and insists Williams's statement must be modified. (50)

(63) Ray, Gordon N. Thackeray: The Age of Wisdom 1847-1863. 1958. New York: Octagon, 1972.

A comprehensive biography of T, which includes his opinions for many of CD's works. Treats AN, CC, DC, DS, Hard Times, LD, Mystery of Edwin Drood, NN, Old Curiosity Shop, Our Mutual Friend, and PP. But some of them are mentioned as comparison to T, and his opinions for them are not discussed.

(64) Irwin, Edward Eugene. "Dickens and Thackeray: The Reciprocal Influences." Diss. U of Florida, 1961.

Discusses relationship of CD and T in framework of the peculiar literary situation, in which they have competed each other. Defines the influences in which each had on the other. Points the overwhelming volume of the work of CD and T resulted in part from the constant pressure of competition. [DAI 22 (1972): 247A]

(65) Hollingsworth, Keith. The Newgate Novel, 1830-1847: Bulwer, Ainsworth, Dickens, and Thackeray. Detroit: Wayne State UP, 1963.

Shows T's attitude to Newgate Novels and his criticism toward OT. Catherine is also dealt with to demonstrate the course of interactions appeared between both novelists. Hollingsworth represents CD's treatment of crime, as the material for novels, had changed; nevertheless he continued to use it. BR and VF is discussed, too.

(66) Mauskopf, Charles. "Thackeray's Attitude Towards Dickens's Writings." NCF 21.1 (1966): 21-33.

A minute study of T's views toward many of CD's works. Almost completely surveying T's remarks, Mauskopf concludes what T admired in CD's writings was his humanity, originality, and the scope and variety of his imagination. And what T differed with CD was in his fundamental conception of the nature of fiction: T believed the function of the novelist was to record a balanced picture of society accurately.

(67) Patten, Robert L. "The Fight at the Top of the Tree: Vanity Fair Versus Dombey and Son." SEL 10.4 (1970): 759-773.

T thought VF's success made CD jealous for him and it led to cool their relationship. However, the ledger of the publisher which was found in 1969 revealed precise sale of both novels, and by this ledger, Patten

concludes VF was not so successful as DS, and the causes of their strained relationship are more likely to be found in their divergent modes of life and philosophies of literature.

(68) Steig, Michael. "Barnaby Rudge and Vanity Fair: A Note on a Possible Influence." NCF 25.3 (1970): 353-354.

Shows a similarity of the father-son relationship in BR and VF. Because of the parallel situation happened in choosing bride, and emblem of "Abraham sacrificing Isaac" seen in both father-son relationship, Steig asserts T was influenced in his handling of the father-son relationship in VF by BR.

(69) Carolan, Katherine. "Dickensian Echoes in a Thackeray Christmas Book." Studies in Short Fiction 11.2 (1974): 196-199.

Discusses the intertextual relationship between DS and Dr. Birch and his Young Friends. Comparing the similarities of characters and school-life of both novels, Carolan asserts T had influenced by DS. Also argues the differences of both and T's attitude to CD, Carolan concludes T failed to understand CD's readiness to venture outside the limits of verisimilitude.

(70) Yoneda, Kazuhiko. "Dickens to Thackeray: Oliver Twist wo megutte [Dickens and Thackeray: Over Oliver Twist]." Gengo to Buntai: Higashida Chiaki Kyouju Kanreki Kinen Ronbunshu. Osaka: Osaka Kyoiku Tosho,

1975.

Discusses reciprocal criticism between T and CD over OT, by Catherine and the OT's third edition preface. Demonstrates T's criticism for OT, and CD's objection for it. Examining criticism in Catherine, Yoneda finds T's doctrine that ruffian shouldn't be melodramatic hero. Also shows the different idea of "realism" of both authors.

(71) ---. "Dickens to Thackeray: David to Pen [Dickens and Thackeray: David and Pen]." Eikoku Shousetsu Kenkyu: Dai 12 Satsu. Tokyo: Shinzaki Shorin, 1977.

Shows T's view for DC, that it is influenced by VF and Pendennis, and asserts that might be T's misunderstanding. Compares the similarities and differences of DC and Pendennis. Through T's criticism toward DC and his other admirations to CD, Yoneda demonstrates T's CD criticism was generally based on "lack of realism."

(72) Cronin, Mark William. "Thackeray's First Fashioned Response to Dickens: The Yellowplush Papers Cast a Cynical Eye on the 'Admiral Boz's' Pickwick Papers." DQu 10.4 (1993): 191-202.

Asserts T's first fashioned response to CD occurs in YP. T transforms elements in PP, for instance, the bright comic world into the savagely corrupt society. Comparing many respects of both novels, Cronin

concludes CD's vision of the community of men is illuminated by the light of optimism, while T focused on harsher elements that define human relationships as much as the light do.

(73) ---. "Textual Relationship between the Fictions of Charles Dickens and William Makepeace Thackeray." Diss. U of Delaware, 1993.

Argues T shaped his fictions in response to CD's, attempting to distinguish his works from CD's. Indicates T frequently rewrote and revised elements from CD's latest novel. Relationships between PP and YP, OT and Catherine, both CBs, DS and VF, and DC and Pendennis are discussed.

(74) ---. "The Rake, The Writer, and The Stranger: Textual Relations between Pendennis and David Copperfield." DSA 24 (1996): 215-240.

Discusses Pendennis' influence on DC. Cronin demonstrates three textual relations: similarities of structure and characters, consciousness for status of the man of letters, and treatment of the same theatrical production, The Stranger. He asserts CD may have shaped characters and events in response to T, and they were responsive to each other's current rival publication.

(75) ---. "Henry Gowan, William Makepeace Thackeray, and 'The Dignity of Literature' Controversy." DQu 16.2 (1999):

Explains disagreement between CD and T. Referring "the dignity of literature" controversy and CD's intention of making a character Henry Gowan of LD (considered T's caricature or CD's narrative response to Clive Newcome of The Newcomes), Cronin asserts CD never wavered in his belief that T treated literary matters too lightly.



## Index of Works

<u>American Notes</u>	13,38,63
<u>Bleak House</u>	37,39
<u>The Battle of Life</u>	20,22
<u>Barnaby Rudge</u>	2,33,68
<u>Catherine</u>	4,7,65,70,73
<u>Christmas Books</u>	15,16,17,18,19,20,21,22,26,36,59,61,63,69,73
<u>Christmas Carol</u>	15,16,17,18,36,59,61,63
<u>Cricket on the Hearth</u>	19,21
<u>The Curate's Walk</u>	25
<u>David Copperfield</u>	27,28,29,30,31,32,41,49,58,59,61,63,71,73,74
<u>Denis Duval</u>	54
<u>Dombey and Son</u>	25,55,61,63,67,69,73
<u>Dr. Birch and his Young Friends</u>	69
<u>Great Expectations</u>	53
<u>Haunted Man</u>	26
<u>Irish Sketch Book</u>	14
<u>Little Dorrit</u>	46,47,48,57,60,63,75
<u>Master Humphrey's Clock</u>	8,9
<u>Mrs. Perkins Ball</u>	20
<u>The Newcomes</u>	75
<u>Nicholas Nickleby</u>	12,36,59,61,63
<u>Novels by Eminent Hands</u>	23
<u>Oliver Twist</u>	1,2,3,4,6,7,11,65,70,73

Paris Sketch Book 10

Pendennis 28,58,71,73,74

The Pickwick Papers 10,22,35,56,63,72,73

Yellowplush Papers 72,73

Vanity Fair 25,27,51,65,67,68,71,73