

Yukie Sasaki

Dr. Eijun Senaha

Scholar and Scholarship

September. 29, 2004

**Tolkien's Background of the Thought behind *The Silmarillion*:  
An Annotated Bibliography**

**1. Introduction**

The aim of this research is to collect the primary and secondary materials that deal with J. R. R. Tolkien (1892-1973) and his epic fantasy, edited by his son, Christopher Tolkien, *The Silmarillion* (1977). The selected 88 materials reveal to the readers the source of Tolkien's literary inspiration and two contradictly ideas, monotheism and polytheism, coexist in Tolkien's works.

In this annotated bibliography, I divide the materials into three sections. In each section, materials are arranged in chronological and alphabetical order. The first section collects the selected primary sources after the publication of *The Silmarillion*—the work itself, author's letters, and the 12 volumes of manuscripts, *The History of Middle-earth* (1983-96). I excluded from vol. 6 to vol. 9, because these books do not contain *The Silmarillion*'s manuscripts. Since *The Silmarillion* is not a 'complete' work arranged by Tolkien himself, critics

sometimes need to see older forms of a particular episode. The second section covers the selected biographies. About the author's life and personality, this research presents Humphrey Carpenter's first biography, *J. R. R. Tolkien: A Biography* (1977), and three other author's study books. Carpenter provides us with Tolkien's general biographical information, so that his work is considered as the most reliable biography. Other writers also refer to the importance of reading Tolkien's interest in the European myths and his Catholicism in the works, so that I picked up them as the main biographical sources that appeared from the late 70s to late 90s. The third section contains the secondary sources: books, critical essays, and articles from 1976 to 2004. This project omitted the materials before *The Silmarillion's* publication and that deal with only Tolkien's former works.

The terms for research are Tolkien, *The Silmarillion*, Middle-earth, myth, mythology, religion, faith, Christianity, Catholic, Catholicism, background, fantasy, narrative, structure, and history. When these terms could not be found in the each title, I read abstracts and book reviews as the reference tools. The sources of the information are MLAIB, EBSCO Host, Humanities Index, DAI, UMI ProQuest Digital Dissertations, NACSIS Webcat, Karlsruher Virtueller Katalog, and amazon.com. Richard C. West's *Tolkien's Criticism: An Annotated Checklist* (1981), Judith A. Johnson's *J. R. R.*

*Tolkien: Six Decade's Criticism* (1986), and Wayne G.

Hammond's *J. R. R. Tolkien: A Descriptive Bibliography* (1993)

also supplied plenty of information about Tolkien's works.

Besides, the references of the three anthologies that were published in 2000 are helpful to know the important critics and scholarly books of Tolkien study through the last half of the century.

Although this work was edited and published after the author's death, *The Silmarillion* is considered the necessary work to understand the structure of 'Middle-earth', the stage of Tolkien's works, because it explains its history and myth in epic prose style. In this story, two of the main characteristics of Tolkien's works, the borrowing from Northern myth and the influence of Christianity, are expressed far more apparently than in *The Hobbit* (1937) and *The Lord of the Rings* (1954-55). As Tolkien's life work, this story is based on his 'attempt to recreate England's lost myth' that had already grown in author's mind during the 1910s, and the revising had continued to the end of his days.

The whole of Tolkien study became deeper and wider after 1977, because *The Silmarillion* and Carpenter's biography supplied more detailed information about Middle-earth and the author himself. Like Carpenter, T. A. Shippey, Brian Rosebury, and many other critics point out the tendency of Tolkien criticism is split into two opposite flows: admiration and abuse.

As Pearce suggests, critics did not estimate the works that contain mystic or romantic modes so highly in the 1950s. For example, Edmund Wilson who claimed *The Lord of the Rings* as a product of escapism is famous as Tolkien's antagonist.

The evaluation of *The Silmarillion* was not so high soon after its publication because of its length and lack of unity. It was boring for general readers, and many critics questioned its value as a literary work, like Neil D. Isaacs' comment in 1981 shows. However, as the author's study proceeded and Tolkien's primary idea 'to create the national myth of England' were known in the 80s, the critics gradually appreciated *The Silmarillion's* merit as 'the source' of Middle-earth works, as Richard Mathews says. Tolkien's attempt to make the whole universe by himself is given a positive reputation because of its peculiarity. In the 80s and 90s, comparative study made a comparison between this work and Milton's *Paradise Lost*, myth criticism analyzed this work with Jungian theory, and folkloric study suggests the narrative similarity between *Edda* or *Kalevala*. Now, *The Silmarillion* is considered as an essential text to understand the meaning of historical or mythical allusions in other works. Like Shippey and Verlyn Flieger, many critics consider it as a tool for searching the linguistic, philosophical, and religious roots of Tolkien that becomes the keys to clear the complicity of Tolkien's work, considering his longing for European myth and Christian faith's influences.

## 2. List of Abbreviations

<i>Amon Hen</i>	<i>Amon Hen: The Bulletin of the Tolkien Society</i>
<i>FS</i>	<i>On Fairy Story</i>
<i>Hobbit</i>	<i>The Hobbit</i>
<i>HM</i>	<i>The History of Middle-earth</i>
<i>JFA</i>	<i>Journal of the Fantastic in the Arts</i>
<i>Letters</i>	<i>The Letters of J. R. R. Tolkien</i>
<i>Mallorn</i>	<i>Mallorn: The Journal of the Tolkien Society.</i>
<i>Minas Tirith Evening Star</i>	<i>Minath Tirith Evening Star: Journal of the Tolkien Society</i>
<i>Mythlore</i>	<i>Mythlore: a journal of J. R. R. Tolkien, C. S. Lewis, Charles Williams, General Fantasy and Mythic Studies.</i>
<i>LR</i>	<i>The Lord of the Rings</i>
<i>Seven</i>	<i>Seven: An Anglo-American Literary Review</i>
<i>Silm</i>	<i>The Silmarillion</i>
<i>UT</i>	<i>The Unfinished Tales</i>

### 3. Primary Sources

1977

[1] Tolkien, J. R. R. *The Silmarillion*. Ed. Christopher Tolkien. 1977. 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. London: Harper, 1999. New York: Del Rey, 2001.

Collected myths and historical episodes of Middle-earth that are based on Tolkien's attempt to recreate England's lost myth.' Contains the motifs that repeatedly appear in Tolkien's works, like the confliction between good and evil, the creation and the destruction, and the power that causes characters' degradation. The most significant theme is the nature of evil, so that *Silm*'s narrative mode is consistently tragic.

1980

[2] Tolkien, J. R. R. *Unfinished Tales*. Ed. Christopher Tolkien. London: Allen & Unwin, 1980. London: Harper, 1998.

The first collection of the rough drafts of *Silm* and *LR*. 'Narn i Hĭn Húlin' and 'The History of Galadriel and Celeborn' supply the more detailed explanation of the episodes that show us the similarity between myth and Tolkien's story.

1981

[3] Tolkien, J. R. R. *The Letters of J. R. R. Tolkien*. Ed. Humphrey Carpenter. London: Allen & Unwin, 1981. London: Harper, 1995.

The collection of Tolkien's private and business letters from 1913 to 1973. In particular, the letters from 1937 shows his attempt to complete *Silm* as a next work of *Hobbit* and the confliction between publishers.

### 1983

[4] Tolkien, J. R. R. *The Book of the Lost Tales, Part One*. Ed. Christopher Tolkien. Vol. 1 of *The History of Middle-earth*. 12 vols. London: Allen & Unwin, 1983. London: Harper, 2002.

Contains the earlier versions of *Silm*'s episodes. Some names of the characters are different with *Silm* itself. There are the earliest and more detailed ideas about the Gods, Elves, and other creatures, of the Silmarils and Two Trees, of Nargothrond and Gondolin. It is useful to learn the process of making the creation myth of Tolkien.

### 1984

[5] Tolkien, J. R. R. *The Book of the Lost Tales, Part Two*. Ed. Christopher Tolkien. Vol. 2 of *The History of Middle-earth*. 12 vols. London: Allen & Unwin, 1984. London: Harper, 2002.

Contains the earlier and more detailed version of the

tales of Beren and Lúthien, Túrin and the Dragon, and the only full narratives of the Necklace of the Dwarves and the Fall of Gondolin. The last chapter, The History of Eriol or Ælfwine is one of the proofs of Tolkien's using of English legend.

### 1985

[6] Tolkien, J. R. R. *The Lays of Beleriand*. Ed. Christopher Tolkien. Vol. 3 of *The History of Middle-earth*. 12 vols. London: Allen & Unwin, 1985. London: Harper, 2002.

The alliterative verse style of two of the main story of *Silm*, titled *Lay of the Children of Húrin* and *The Lay of Lúthien*. Christopher Tolkien sets these verses as the chief sources of the Túrin and Lúthien's story.

### 1986

[7] Tolkien, J. R. R. *The Shaping of Middle-earth*. Ed. Christopher Tolkien. Vol. 4 of *The History of Middle-earth*. 12 vols. London: Allen & Unwin, 1986. London: Harper, 2002.

Describes the shaping of the chronological and geographical structure of the legends of Middle-earth and Valinor. Also includes the original 'Silmarillion' of 1926, and the *Quenta Noldorinwa* of 1930, the only version of the myths and legends of the First Age that Tolkien completed to the end.



## 1987

[8] Tolkien, J. R. R. *The Lost Road and Other Writings*. Ed. Christopher Tolkien. Vol. 5 of *The History of Middle-earth*. 12 vols. London: Allen & Unwin, 1986. London: Harper, 2002.

Completes the examination of his writing about Valinor and Middle-earth's heroic legends before the start of writing of *LR*, 1937-38. The Legend of the Downfall of Númelor had entered the work, including those central ideas: the World Made Round and the Straight Path into the West.

## 1993

[9] Tolkien, J. R. R. *Morgoth's Ring*. Ed. Christopher Tolkien. Vol. 10 of *The History of Middle-earth*. 12 vols. 1993. London: Harper, 2002.

The manuscripts of later history of *Silm*. The text of the Annals of Aman is given in full, and each episodes show the readers that the matter of good and evil becomes the heart of the *LR* and *Silm* through the description of Morgoth(Melkor), the greatest power of evil in Arda.

## 1994

[10] Tolkien, J. R. R. *The war of the Jewels*. Ed. Christopher Tolkien. Vol. 11 of *The History of Middle-earth*. 12 vols. 1994.

London: Harper, 2002.

The later history of *Silm* from the point where it was left in vol.10, and refers the history of the First Age of Middle-earth, mainly the conflicts of the High Elves and the Men who were their allies with the power of the Dark Lord. It supplements the description of *Silm* and *The Book of Lost Tales*.

### 1996

[11] Tolkien, J. R. R. *The Peoples of Middle-earth*. Ed. Christopher Tolkien. Vol.12 of *The History of Middle-earth*. 12 vols. 1996. London: Harper, 2002.

The supplement of the appendices to *LR* and fragmental writing related to *Silm*. Part two reveals us Tolkien's new insights and new constructions in his last years, in particular, the nomenclature of the Elves and detailed information about Men, Dwarves, and Wizards.

### 2002

[12] Tolkien, J. R. R. *The History of Middle-earth Index*. Ed. Christopher Tolkien. London: Harper, 2002.

Covers the various indexes contained in the whole *HM*. It provides the readers all the peoples, places, and other significant entries of Middle-earth in alphabetical order.

#### 4. Biographical Information

1976

[13] Kilby, Clyde S. *Tolkien & The Silmarillion*. Wheaton: Harold Shaw, 1976.

A reportage of Tolkien and his attitude to try to complete *Silm*. The most of the information is based on Kilby's interview with Tolkien. Chapter 3 and 4 is particularly detailed about the relationship between Tolkien's works and his Catholic faith.

1977

[14] Carpenter, Humphrey. *J. R. R. Tolkien: A Biography*. London: Allen & Anwin, 1977. London: Harper, 2002.

The most reliable biography of Tolkien. Carpenter succeeded in describing Tolkien's conversion of a Catholic and the process he had a strong interest about myth and legend of Europe in detail. It shows Tolkien's religious mind and longing for myth that are assimilated in his thought.

1981

[15] Crabbe, Katharyn F. *J. R. R. Tolkien*. New York: Ungar, 1981.

An author's study that explains the contents of *Silm*. It

evaluates *Silm* as the core of Tolkien's works and the most difficult to understand part because of its length and lack of unity.

[16] Pearce, Joseph. *Tolkien: Man and Myth*. 1998. London: Harper, 1999.

An author's study book that mainly owes to the biographical facts. Evaluates *Silm* as the basis of his whole works, and points out Tolkien was often 'misunderstood' by critics who are considers myth as mere illusion and products of escapism. Chapter 6 shows the similarities between *Silm* and *Genesis*, Milton's *Paradise Lost*, and Augustine Theology.

## 5. Secondary Sources

1978

[17] Foster, Robert. *The Complete Guide to Middle-earth: Tolkien's World from A to Z*. Rev. ed. New York: Ballantine, 1978.

An index of the terms, name of the places and people, things, and historical events about *LR*, *Sil*, and *Hobbit*. All the terms are arranged according to alphabetical order. Each item has detailed explanation and source of the information.

[18] Mathews, Richard. *Lightning from a Clear Sky: Tolkien, The Trilogy, and the Silmarillion*. San Bernardino: Borgo, 1978.

Summarizes Tolkien's major works as a general guide. Evaluates *Silm* as a myth rather than a novel because of its narrative's peculiarity, and positions it as a primary source of *LR*. Mathews says that *Silm* represents the Christian moral by the Northern mythic form.

1981

[19] Helms, Randel. *Tolkien and the Silmarils: Imagination and Myth in "The Silmarillion"*. New York: Houghton, 1981.

"Delineates Tolkien's gladful creation, and traces some of the sources, analogues, themes and publication history of *The Silmarillion* and shows its relationship to

Tolkien's other works. Traces as influences from William Morris, the Bible, Milton, the *Kalevala*, the *Mabinogian*, and the Elder Edda." [Johnson, Judith A. *J. R. R. Tolkien: Six Decades of Criticism*. Bibliographies and Indexes in World Lit. 6. Westport: Greenwood. 211]

[20] Isaacs, Neil D. "On the Need for Writing Tolkien Criticism." Ed. Neil D. Isaacs and Rose A. Zimbardo. *Tolkien: New Critical Perspectives*. Lexington: UP of Kentucky, 1981. 1-7.

Review of the critical tendency on Tolkien's works up to 1981. Evaluates *Silm* is not argued enough, so that it is only useful to proof the relationship between Tolkien's motivation for writing and his Christian faith, with a citation from Paul Kocher's book.

[21] Kocher, Paul. "Middle-earth: An Imaginary World?" Ed. Neil D. Isaacs and Rose A. Zimbardo. *Tolkien: New Critical Perspectives*. Lexington: UP of Kentucky, 1981. 117-132.

With a citation from *FS*, proofs the similarity of geographical, historical, biological elements of Middle-earth and real world. Points out the similarities between the characteristic and location of the Undying Lands of *Silm* and Celtic tale, *imrama*.

[22] McLellan, Joseph. "Frodo and the Cosmos: Reflections on 'The Silmarillion'." Ed. Neil D. Isaacs and Rose A. Zimbardo. *Tolkien: New Critical Perspectives*. Lexington: UP of Kentucky, 1981. 163-167.

Introduces *Silm* as a predecessor of *LR*. Emphasizes *Silm*'s importance to understand the worldview of Tolkien's works that considers every event as the component of the world itself, for the events of *Silm* is told in *LR* as historical facts.

[23] West, Richard C. *Tolkien Criticism: An Annotated Checklist*. The Serif Ser. 39. Kent: Kent State UP, 1981.

An annotated bibliography of the primary sources and critical essays about Tolkien's works including book reviews and Ph.D. dissertation. About critical responses, this book contains 755 secondary materials from 1920s to 1981. Provides three categorizes of materials and indexes in alphabetical order: list of Tolkien's writings, list of books, list of the essay's titles, checklist of Dissertations, and information of major fan organizations and publications.

[24] Wicher, Andrzej. "The Artificial Mythology of *The Silmarillion* by J. R. R. Tolkien." *Kwartalnik Neofilologiczny* 28. 3-4 (1981): 399-405.

Insists on the sources of *Silm* are both the Bible and the Greek/Nordic myth. The degradation of the creatures and their relationships between God and the higher creature than one's own race is affected by Christian belief, and the battle between the heroes and the evil creatures are influenced from Northern saga. These two characteristics are gathered together by the tragic mood and final loss after the victory, because it reflects that Tolkien's feeling about the disappearance of every mythological belief is paralleled with the predominance of Christianity.

### 1982

[25] Shippey, T. A. *The Road to Middle-earth*. London: Allen and Unwin, 1982.

Explains the connection between Tolkien's creativity and the sources of his inspiration. Discusses the contribution of *Silm* and *UT* to Tolkien's myth-cycle, showing how Tolkien's more 'difficult' works can be read enjoyably and seriously by readers of his earlier books. [http://www.amazon.com/exec/obidos/tg/detail/-/0618257608/qid=1097171436/sr=8-1/ref=sr\_8\_xs\_ap\_il\_xgl14/102-0038638-9744948?v=glance&s=books&n=507846]

### 1983



[26] Flieger, Verlyn. *Splintered light: Logos and Language in Tolkien's World*. Grand Rapids: WM. B. Erdmans, 1983.

Discusses the images of Light and Darkness in Tolkien's world and their meaning, especially these motifs in *Silm* and *LR*. Takes up Tolkien's conversion as an important matter among his biographical facts, and points out the connection between Christian view and these images.

#### 1984

[27] Elton, Davis Larry. "A Christian Philosophical Examination of The Picture of Evil in the Writings of J. R. R. Tolkien." Diss. Southwestern Baptist Theological Seminary, 1983.

Tries to find Tolkien's aesthetic literary presentation of evil can be best described as a mystic portrayal of the Augustinian classical Christian view of evil. Chapter III describes the myth of the origin of evil as portrayed in *Silm*, highlighting Tolkien's emphasis on the doctrine of the Fall and his reliance on a free-will explanation of the origin of evil. [*DAI*-A44/12 (1984): 3712]

[28] Purtill, Richard L. *J. R. R. Tolkien: Myth, Morality, and Religion*. San Francisco: Harper, 1984.

Suggests the basic source of *Silm* is the Christian belief, especially the creation myth (Ainulindarë), in chapter 7, but the two points are different from Judeo-Christian

theology: Ainur's role as 'subcreators', and their male/female feature. Analysis these differences as Tolkien's artistic writing technique to use pagan mythology to represent Christianity, like Renaissance Christian artists.

[29] Rawls, Melanie. "The Feminine Principle in Tolkien." *Mythlore* 38 (1984): 5-13.

Insists on the balance of gender and the balance of the word's condition effect on each other in Tolkien's works. Rawls analyzes the meaning of 'masculine' elements and 'feminine' elements based on the Jungian theory, and when the world is in 'bad' condition, the negative power of each element is operated.

### 1985

[30] Burgess, Michael. "Oromë and the Wild Hunt: the development of a myth." *Mallorn* 22 (1985): 5-11.

Analyzes the similarity between Oromë, one of the gods in *Silm*, and the 'Wild Hunt', the haunted hunter in Northern Europe folklore. This image was created from people's awe for the hard weather like a thunderstorm, and the Elves' fear when they first hear the sound of Oromë's ride is similar to this reaction.

[31] Crossley, Robert. "A Long Day's Dying: The Elves of J. R. R. Tolkien and Sylvia Townsend Warner." Ed. Carl B. Yoke and Donald M Hassler. *Death and Serpent: Immortality in Science Fiction and Fantasy*. Contributions to the Study of Science Fiction and Fantasy. 13. Westport: Greenwood, 1985. 49-56.

Comparative essay on *Silm* and Warner's *Kingdoms of Elfin*. With a citation from Milton's *Paradise Lost*, Crossley says the elves in each works are in common with the point they cannot find rest and consolation the world because of their immortality.

[32] Egan, Thomas M. "*The Silmarillion* and The Rise of Evil: The Birth Pains of Middle-earth." *Seven* 6 (1985): 79-84.

An supplementary explanation on *Silm*. Egan defines that the main concern of Tolkien as a mythmaker is a question of evil, and points out the similarity between Melkor/Morgoth and Satan.

[33] Kocher, Paul. "Ilúvatar and The Secret Fire." *Mythlore* 43 (1985): 36-37.

Analyzes Ilúvatar, the greatest god of the world in Tolkien's works. The three names of the God, Ilúvatar, Eru, and the One suggest a kind of trinity, and 'the Secret Fire' means the eternity of its power. Because of its power and the relationship between 'the Fire' (the

light), Kocher insists that the influence of Christianity was not lost upon Tolkien's works.

### 1986

[34] Fliieger, Verlyn. "Naming the Unnameable: The Neoplatonic 'One' in Tolkien's *Silmarillion*." Ed. Thomas Halton and Joseph P. Williman. Washington DC: Catholic U of Amer. P, 1986. 127-132.

An philosophical analysis of *Silm*. Points out that Tolkien's description on Ilúvatar is in common with the Neoplatonic thoughts about the God that consider him as 'the One'. Ilúvatar's another name, Eru, means a name for unnamable one, and its concept is close to Dionysius' concept of Holy Names.

[35] Johnson, Judith A. *J. R. R. Tolkien: Six Decades of Criticism*. Bibliographies and Indexes in World Lit. 6. Westport: Greenwood, 1986.

An annotated bibliography of Tolkien's primary works and critical essays about the works from 1922 to 1984. Chapter 3 contains 21 primary sources and 461 secondary sources during last 10 years, and expresses the readers and the critics' response toward *Silm* as a kind of 'shock'. However, evaluates it as 'an interesting source book' that helps Tolkien's scholar to deepen their understanding.

- [36] Mende, Lisa Anne. "Gondolin, Minas Tirith and the Eucatastrophe." *Mythlore* 48 (1986): 37-40.

Points out the similarity between the episode of Minas Tirith in *LR* and Gondolin in *Silm*. Their location and political position in Middle-earth are similar to each other, and both episodes represent Tolkien's religious morals: confession, absolution, resurrection, and eucatastrophe.

### 1987

- [37] Agøy, Nils Ivar. "A Nodal Structure in Tolkien's Tales of the First Age?" *Mythlore* 50 (1987): 22-25.

Compares the episodes that are shared in *Silm*, *LR*, *Hobbit*, and *HM* and discusses Tolkien's tendency to use the same images and to revise the same episodes repeatedly. The similar episodes which appears in these stories help to understand the 'nodes' in the several stories, and reveals the points and themes that Tolkien was most interested in.

- [38] Evans, Robley. "Tolkien's World-Creation: Degenerative Recurrence." *Mythlore* 51 (1987): 5-8, 47.

Explains the narrative structure of *Silm* and *LR*. Evans sets degenerative recurrences as the main plot of Tolkien's works because the creation and the destruction

are occurs alternately in *Silm* and *LR*. Points out the facts that “creation” always contains the seeds of degeneration that caused by having the desire to make and possess better thing, and “possessiveness” is significant key to destruct a person, a nation, and order of the world.

### 1988

- [39] Greenman, David. “*The Silmarillion* as Aristotelian Epic-Tragedy.” *Mythlore* 53 (1988): 20-25.

Indicates Aristotle’s *Poetics* influences *Silm* and insists Tolkien expands Aristotle’s notions by the matters of language, spectacle, magnitude, and plot. In the level of characters, Fëanor, Thingol, and Finrod’s fate and personality are presented as the examples of “hamartia” in Greek tragedy.

- [40] Veith, Gene Edward. “Fantasy and the Tradition of Christian Art.” *Mythlore* 53 (1988): 34-37.

Analyzes Christianity as the backgrounds of many authors of modern fantasy literature, such as Tolkien, Lewis, MackDonald. Veith shows the art’s tradition and way of express when it has occurred in ancient Greece, and the process these had mingled with Christianity.

## 1990

[41] Broadwell, Elizabeth. "Essë and Narn: Name, Identity, and Narrative in the Tale of Túrin Turambar." *Mythlore* 64 (1990): 34-44.

Analyzes the magical aspects of the naming as the figuration of individual or social identity that is exemplified by Túrin and his various pseudonyms. His names and these meanings interrelate with the narrative of his checkered life, so that these enhance the main plot and the tragic mood of the story.

[42] Provost, William. "Language and Myth in the Fantasy Writings of J. R. R. Tolkien." *Modern Age* 33.1 (1990): 43-52.

Takes up the 'mythical elements' of language and its action in Tolkien's works, especially *Silm* and *LR*. Evil language is the language of power used to force a creature into predetermined patterns, on the other hand good language means truth and accepting the free will or realness of all creation.

[43] Syme, Margaret Ruth. "Tolkien as Gospel Writer." Diss. McGill U, 1989.

Citing Tolkien's evangelic theory in *FS*, Syme evaluates Tolkien as a gospel writer who uses the allusions to biblical and classical mythology. Describes Tolkien's

effort to provide his tale with a consistent Christian point of view is less successful, for his portrayal of Evil is slightly weak. [*DAI-A50/04* (1989): 973]

### 1991

[44] Barnfield, Marie. "Celtic Influences on the History of First Age." *Mallorn* 28 (1991): 2-6.

Points out that *Silm* and *LR* contain many Celtic influences in spite of Tolkien's denial. As the proof, Barnfield lists the characteristics of the Elves and their sailing to the West.

[45] Beach, Sarah. "Fire and Ice: The Traditional Heroine in The Silmarillion." *Mythlore* 67 (1991): 37-41.

Analyzes four heroines in *Silm* using Jungian theory, the Fair and Dark Heroines archetypes. After discusses on the positive and negative elements of Tolkien's heroines, Beach concludes where the heroines take action to assist their hero, there is a positive result in the course of events.

### 1992

[46] O'brien, Donald. "The Genesis of Arda." *Mallorn* 29 (1992): 44-53.

A chronological record of Tolkien's works from 1916 to



1973. Compares the same episodes in *Silm* and its former manuscripts, *The Book of Lost Tales*, and their stage of writing and their process of revising. Through these processes, O'Brien examines the interrelationship between each works and Tolkien's attempt to make his own mythopoeia has already begun in 1910s.

[47] Rosebury, Brian. *Tolkien: A Critical Assessment*. New York: ST. Martin's P, 1992.

Tries to reveal that Tolkien's originality and modernity in each works neither over-praising nor disposable view. Compared *Silm* to *LR*, Rosebury says they are fundamentally different from each other, although they share the same places and history. Unlike *LR*, the mode and the narrative of *Silm* are fundamentally dark, and depict the process of corruption through the Augustian theory, explicitly.

### 1993

[48] De Anna, Luigi. "The Magic of Words: J. R. R. Tolkien and Finland." Ed. K. J. Batterbee. *Scholarship & Fantasy: Proceedings of The Tolkien Phenomenon, May 1992, University of Turku, Finland*. Turku: U of Turku, 1993. 7-19.

Refers to the relationship between Tolkien's works and old Finnish saga, *Kalevala*, as a source of his inspiration.

Being exemplified with Túrin's tale in *Silm* and Kullervo's story in *Kalevala*, Luigi emphasizes that *Kalevala* influences on the structure of *Silm* especially in the aspect of narrative structure as the tragic myth.

[49] Dodds, David Llewellyn. "Technology and Sub-creation: Tolkien's Alternative to the Dominant Worldview." Ed. K. J. Batterbee. *Scholarship & Fantasy: Proceedings of The Tolkien Phenomenon, May 1992, University of Turku, Finland*. Turku: U of Turku, 1993. 165-186.

Refers to the similarity between 'technology' and 'creation', for they both are in common with the idea to realize the products of human's free will and imagination. In his Christian view, Tolkien defines creation as the God's activity, so that Melkor and Aulë's creation without the permission from Ilúvatar is considered rebellious act.

[50] Duriez, Colin. "Sub-creation and Tolkien's Theology of Story." Ed. K. J. Batterbee. *Scholarship & Fantasy: Proceedings of The Tolkien Phenomenon, May 1992, University of Turku, Finland*. Turku: U of Turku, 1993. 133-150.

Explains Tolkien's Christian theology through the images of nature and grace in the story. Duriez insists that Tolkien creates his fictional world as a fusion of the

Christian inwardly and paganism on the surface, to symbolize the hope of Christianity in pre-Christian world and emphasize and its effect on the world.

[51] Heinemann, Fredric J. "Tolkien and Old Icelandic Literature." Ed. K. J. Batterbee. *Scholarship & Fantasy: Proceedings of The Tolkien Phenomenon, May 1992, University of Turku, Finland*. Turku: U of Turku, 1993. 99-109.

Shows the relationship between *Silm* and Icelandic saga, in particular, the point of view about the likeness between their narrative styles. Heinemann suggests that *Silm* contains the three apparent characteristic of the saga: the historian-like narrative voice, the dialogue which typifies characters as a function, and the implicit intertextuality that shows the author's feeling toward their tradition. Moreover, *Silm's* episodes of the internecine family conflict and interweaving of doom are common with the saga.

[52] Scull, Christina. "The Influence of Archaeology and History on Tolkien's World." Ed. K. J. Batterbee. *Scholarship & Fantasy: Proceedings of The Tolkien Phenomenon, May 1992, University of Turku, Finland*. Turku: U of Turku, 1993. 33-51.

Investigates the cultural sources of Middle-earth residents through the description of the architecture.

With the references from the historical studies of J. D. E. Lieblein and W. Stuckley, Scull points out the similarity between Middle-earth and real world, not only Northern and mediaeval, but also Egyptian, Celtic, and Roman.

[53] Shippey, T. A. "Tolkien as a Post-War Writer." Ed. K.J. Batterbee. *Scholarship & Fantasy: Proceedings of The Tolkien Phenomenon, May 1992, University of Turku, Finland*. Turku: U of Turku, 1993. 217-236.

Suggests the characteristic of Tolkien's idea about the nature of the evil is parted into inner and outward one. The former that considers the inner confliction or weakness as an enemy is based on the Christianity, on the other hand the latter that represents the battle against an enemy is based on Northern heroic saga.

[54] Gough, John. "Tolkien's Creation Myth in *The Silmarillion*—Northern or Not?" *Children's Literature in Education* 30.1 (1993): 1-8.

Tries to break down stereotypes about the sources of Tolkien's fictions. To focus on the episode of 'the creation of the world', he proofs the similarity of Tolkien's works and myth is not only pagan, but also Christian. The strength of this essay is to insist that the basis of Tolkien's identity is Christianity, even if it looks pagan on

the surface.

[55] Hammond, Wayne G. *J. R. R. Tolkien: A Descriptive Bibliography*. Winchester: St Paul's Bibliographies; New Castle: Oak Knoll, 1993.

An annotated bibliography of Tolkien's all primary works. Besides his novels and published essays like *FS*, this book covers his interviews, scholarly essays as a philologist, and paintings with detailed publication data.

#### 1995

[56] Agøy, Nils Ivar. "*Quid Hinieldus cum Christo? – New Perspectives on Tolkien's Theological Dilemma and his Sub-Creation Theory.*" Ed. Patricia Reynolds and Glen Goodnight. *Proceedings of the J. R. R. Tolkien Centenary Conference 1992*. Altadena: Mythopoeic; Milton Keynes: The Tolkien Society, 1995: 31-38.

Points out striking parallels between Tolkien's idea of sub-creation and Danish theologian, N. F. S. Grundtvig's one. They both have a strong interest for Northern and Anglo-Saxon mythology, language, and philosophy, in spite of their position as Christian.

[57] Barkley, Christine. "Point of View in Tolkien." Ed. Patricia

Reynolds and Glen Goodnight. *Proceedings of the J. R. R. Tolkien Centenary Conference 1992*. Altadena: Mythopoeic; Milton Keynes: The Tolkien Society, 1995. 256-262.

Based on the diagram of levels of interpretation by Hazard Adams, examines Tolkien's technique of using a limited or omniscient point of view. Because of its need for political and vast interest, the narrator of *Silm* is necessarily omniscient/third-person.

[58] Hostetter, Carl F. and Arden R. Smith. "A Mythology for England." Ed. Patricia Reynolds and Glen Goodnight. *Proceedings of the J. R. R. Tolkien Centenary Conference 1992*. Altadena: Mythopoeic; Milton Keynes: The Tolkien Society, 1995. 281-290.

Recites the five figures in *Silm* and *HM* that show the influences from Anglo-Saxon legend. Their episodes and meanings of names vouch for Tolkien's creative attempt to make his own story as supporting episode of real English history.

[59] Houghton, John. "Augustine and *the Ainulindalë*." *Mythlore* 79 (1995): 4-8.

Points out the similarity between Augustine's *De Genesi*, a symbolic interpretation on Genesis and *the Ainulindalë*, Tolkien's creation myth of *Silm*. Both authors consider

the angels as God's agents who obey him, and carry out the creation of the world instead of the God.

[60] Lewis, Alex. "Historical Bias in the Making of *The Silmarillion*." Ed. Patricia Reynolds and Glen Goodnight. *Proceedings of the J. R. R. Tolkien Centenary Conference 1992*. Altadena: Mythopoeic; Milton Keynes: The Tolkien Society, 1995. 158-166.

Analyzes *Silm* as an English translated historical archive that written in secondary (imaginary) world's language. Lewis suggests that the defect of *Silm*'s narrative as a lack of fairness like real history book, and shows 'the history' told in *Silm* is influenced from the biases and one-sided perspective based on the attempt to justify their own side of its authors: Elves, especially Elrond and his people. Because of their intent, the Mortals and rebellious minority of Elves (Fëanorians)'s deeds are distorted.

[61] Sanford, Len. "The Fall from Grace – Decline and Fall in Middle-earth: Metaphors for Nordic and Christian theology in *The Lord of the Rings* and *The Silmarillion*." *Mallorn* 32 (1995): 15-20.

Insists 'the fall' depicted by the history of Silmarils and the downfall of Númenor as the main themes of Tolkien's

works. Sanford suggests that Nordic and Christian elements coexist in the story. For the Nordic allusion about straggle between heroes and monsters inner enemies also means the inner confliction of the people between good and evil as Christian image of mental trial.

[62] Schweinicher, Eric. "Aspects of the Fall in *The Silmarillion*." Ed. Patricia Reynolds and Glen Goodnight. *Proceedings of the J. R. R. Tolkien Centenary Conference 1992*. Altadena: Mythopoeic; Milton Keynes: The Tolkien Society, 1995. 167-171.

Explains the cause of each race in the work's 'Fall' as the desire for further power, possessiveness, and mimicry of creation. Exemplified by the episode of Original Sin and Adam and Eve's expulsion from Garden of Eden, and the passage about creation and sub-creation in *FS*, Schweicher shows that these three desires are considered as the profane of the God (Ilúvatar).

[63] St. Clair, Gloriana. "An Overview of the Northern Influences on Tolkien's Works." Ed. Patricia Reynolds and Glen Goodnight. *Proceedings of the J. R. R. Tolkien Centenary Conference 1992*. Altadena: Mythopoeic; Milton Keynes: The Tolkien Society, 1995. 63-67.



Introduces the Old Norse Literature and mythology, such as *Edda*, *The Volsunga Saga*, and *Njal's Saga*, as the sources of Tolkien's works. The similarities between them are showed as characteristics of each races, heroic personality, and fatalism.

### 1997

[64] Drout, Michael David Craig. "Imitating Fathers: Tradition, Inheritance and the Reproduction of Culture in Anglo-Saxon England." Diss. Loyola U of Chicago, 1997.

Discusses inheritance and tradition that shape Anglo-Saxon culture through their influence upon the reproduction of identities and institutions. Suggests Tolkien and Albert S. Cook as two influential Anglo-Saxonist scholars of the Twentieth century who try to resurrect long-dead Anglo-Saxonist identities.

[*DAI-A* 58/03 (1997): 334]

[65] Flieger, Verlyn. *A Question of Time: J. R. R. Tolkien's Road to Faëlie*. Kent: Kent State UP, 1997.

Combines Tolkien's longing for Other Time (past) with his notion about Faëlie, the other world that has a different flow of time, especially in *The Lost Road* and *LR*. Insists on Tolkien's thought about the past's goodness is connected with the skeptical view for modern

society, the one of the main plot of his whole works.

[66] Irigarey, Richardo Luis. "Tolkien and Christian Faith." Diss. Universidad de Navarra, 1996.

Endeavours to study the implicit theological contents of Tolkien's works with a matter of Tolkien's Christian faith. Through the discussion about Tolkien's literally myth, creature's ontology, the problem of evil, Providence, free will, and character's spiritual growth.

[DAI- C 58/02 (1997): 357]

#### 1998

[67] Hein, Rolland. *Christian Mythmakers: C. S. Lewis, Madeleine L'Engle, J. R. R. Tolkien, George MacDonald, G. K. Chesterton & Others*. 1998. Chicago: Cornerstone, 2002.

A handbook about the modern Christian fantasy writers and their works. Explains *Silm*'s summary, the meaning of 'good' and 'evil' in the work, and the similarity between their characters and biblical characters.

[68] Whittingham, Elizabeth A. "The Mythology of the 'Ainulindalë': Tolkien's Creation of Hope." *JFA* 9 (1998): 212-228.

Citing Roland Barthes's theory about myth, evaluates

the characteristic of *the Ainulindalë* is a naturalization of the world. Through the analysis on the three important elements in *Silm*: the struggle between good and evil, the supremacy of Ilúvatar, and sustaining hope, Whittingham states *the Ainulindalë* is a myth that helps the people of Middle-earth to understand the World's order.

### 1999

[69] Garbowski, Christopher. "The history of Middle-Earth: from a Mythology for England to a Recovery of the Real Earth." *Mallon* 37 (1999): 21-27.

Analyzes the mythic elements in Tolkien's works based on Victor E. Frankl's existential analysis, Tolkien's 'sub-creation' theory, and the biographical facts. Suggests Tolkien considers 'sub-creation' as a reflection of the real events in the world and a tool to recover from the wound. In *Silm*, the tale of Túrin and the Fall of Gondolin are reflects Tolkien's traumatic experience in WW I .

[70] Timmons, Daniel Patrick. "Mirror on Middle-earth: J. R. R. Tolkien and the Critical Perspectives." Diss. U of Tronto, 1998.

General history of Tolkien study that includes the author's self-criticism. Suggests the publication of his

three main works, *Hobbit*, *LR*, and *Silm* as the important stage that influences on the critical tendency, and discusses critical responses toward them. [*DAI-A* 60/01 (1999): 143]

## 2000

[71] Egginton, Mark. "Tolkien's Corrupt World." *Amon Hen* 164 (2000): 20-22.

Points out that the most outstanding theme of Tolkien's works, includes *Silm*, is corruption. Through the structure of the good and the evil—the good stay good and the good turns bad/the bad always been bad stays bad—shows the firmness of the binary between good and evil.

[72] Evans, Jonathan. "The Dragon-Lore of Middle-earth: Tolkien and Old English and Old Norse Tradition." Ed. Geprge Clark and Daniel Timmons. *J. R. R. Tolkien and His Literary Resonances*. Contributions to the Study of Science Fiction and Fantasy. 89. Westport: Greenwood, 2000. 21-38.

Focuses on the dragon as a motif of evil monster and its slaying by the hero as a narrative type in Tolkien's works, and seeks the roots of them in *Beowulf* and *Völsunga Saga*. The episode of Túrin's battle against Glaulung the dragon in *Silm* is apparently influenced by

Northern and medieval tradition of dragon lore, as a mixture of the “Sigurd” type and “Thor” type that categorized by Axel Olrik.

[73] Kocher, Paul H. “A Mythology for England.” Ed. Harold Bloom. *J. R. R. Tolkien: Modern Critical Views*. Philadelphia: Chelsea House, 2000. 103-111.

Explanations about Tolkien’s fundamental aim of writing to create ‘the original myth’ for England and its considerable source of inspiration: Norse-Icelandic *Edda* and the *Kalevala*. However, Kocher emphasizes their connection is mainly in the level of the prose (narrative) style and tragic matters, for Tolkien accepts the different worldview for the episodes of the creation and the end of the world, positioning of the gods, and the fatalism. Ilúvatar, the mightiest God and the individual free will are more important in *Silm* and other works.

[74] Noad, Charles E. “On the Construction of ‘The Silmarillion’.” Ed. Verlyn Flieger and Carl F. Hostetter. *Tolkien’s Legendarium: Essays on The History of Middle-earth*. Contributions to the Study of Science Fiction and Fantasy. 86. Westport: Greenwood, 2000. 31-67.

Chronological record of Tolkien’s writing process of *Silm*,

with the relationship between a mount of manuscripts in *HM*. Explains how Tolkein stick a balance between his interests for Northern myth or medieval/Anglo-Saxon legends and his idea to recreate the lost myth of England in the real world.

[75] Senior, W. A. "Loss Eternal in J. R. R. Tolkien's Middle-earth." Ed. George Clark and Daniel Timmons. *J. R. R. Tolkien and His Literary Resonances*. Contributions to the Study of Science Fiction and Fantasy. 89. Westport: Greenwood, 2000. 173-182.

Combines the outstanding theme of Tolkien's works includes *Silm*, sense of loss, with the tragic mood of Northern myth. After the reference of many critics' opinions, Senior evaluates *Silm* as the basis of *LR* that explains his theory to imagine the future's hope from the past's loss and destruction.

[76] Shippey, T. A. *J. R. R. Tolkien: Author of the Century*. London: HarperCollins, 2000.

Evaluates Tolkien and his works, especially *LR*, as one of the most significant book in the 20<sup>th</sup> century. Also examines the fundamental importance of *Silm* to the canon of Tolkien's work.

[<http://www.amazon.com/exec/obidos/tg/detail/-/0618257>

594/qid=1097176690/sr=1-2/ref=sr\_1\_2/102-0038638-974  
4948?v=glance&s=books]

[77] Sly, Debbie. "Weaving Nets of Gloom: 'Darkness Profound' in Tolkien and Milton." Ed. George Clark and Daniel Timmons. *J. R. R. Tolkien and His Literary Resonances*. Contributions to the Study of Science Fiction and Fantasy. 89. Westport: Greenwood, 2000. 109-119.

Analyzes *Silm* as a story of long series of creations and falls through the motifs of shaping the world, through the comparing of biblical allusion in Milton's *Paradise Lost*. While Milton's religious view is based on Protestantism, Tolkien believes Roman Catholic, so that *Silm* and its system of world are medieval. The differences between them are showed as the evil figure, the image of darkness, and the function of female characters.

## 2001

[78] Chance, Jean. *A Mythology for England*. Lexington: UP of Kentucky, 2001.

Beginning Tolkien's aim of writing to create 'a mythology for England', Chance analyzes the relationship between myth and each work. *Silm* is positioned as a "lost book" because of its characteristic

as a history book of Middle-earth and its lack of the complete form.

[79] Heydt. Bruce. "J. R. R. Tolkien." *British Heritage* 22.6 (2001): 14-16.

A biographical essay about Tolkien. Refers to his interest in myths, and positions *Silm* as a trigger of his life-long creative activity. Alludes to his perfectionism, and suggests it causes *Silm's* incompleteness.

## 2002

[80] Cooper, Susan. "There and Back Again: Tolkien Reconsidered." *Horn Book Magazine* 78.2 (2002): 143-150.

Explains Tolkien's interests for Anglo-Saxon, Norse, Icelandic literature and his experiences during WW I and II.

[81] Flieger, Verlyn. "A Cautiously Tale." *The Chesterton Review: J. R. R Tolkien Mythos and Modernity in Middle-Earth* 28 (2002): 97-103.

Mentions Tolkien's shock for WW I and II, and insists these are reflected into the wars and the damage to the Elves and the Men in *Silm*. Flieger says Tolkien's strategy that symbolizes the taboo or misfortune of particular culture with transcendent phenomenon is



similar to the strategy of myth.

[82] Tyler, J. E. A. *The Complete Tolkien Companion*. 3<sup>rd</sup> ed. London: Pan Books, 1976. London: Pan Macmillan, 2002.

A reference book of the terms about all Tolkien's works related to Middle-earth. It covers not only the terms of *LR*, *Hobbit*, and *Silm*, but also other minor works', *UT* and *HM*. Each term is arranged in alphabetical order with detailed explanation, but sources of the information are omitted.

### 2003

[83] Birzer, Bradley, J. "Tolkien: Man Behind the Myth." *Christian History* 22.2 (2003): 10-14.

An biographical essay about Tolkien. Suggests that *Silm*'s biblical characteristic reflects Tolkien's opposition to the political-left readers who worship *LR* as a book of 'new paganism' in 1960s, when he mainly revised *Silm*.

[84] Ellison, John. "From Fëanor to Doctor Faustus: a creator's path to self destruction." *Mallorn* 41 (2003): 13-21.

Compares the episode of Fëanor and Doctor Faustus stories written by Goethe and Thomas Mann, and shows their similarity: creativity, eagerness for knowledge,

and the existence of the evil figure who leads them to self-destruction—Melkor/Morgoth and Mephistopheles. Ellison suggests that Fëanor's fall is one of a metaphor of Tolkien's warning for modern world, because he repeatedly uses the pattern of tragedy caused by the desire for excessive power and obsession for the products of one's creativity.

[85] Gloge, Andreas. "Re-writing the Past – The Pillars of Middle-earth." *Mallorn* 41 (2003): 44-52.

Evaluates *Silm* as a source of all Tolkien's works and it represents human's potential longing for myth and religion to understand the system of the world in the new way. Lists the supposed sources, namely, old language, Norse mythology, Anglo-Saxon Mythology, and the Bible.

[86] Howard, Thomas. "Sacramental Imagination." *Christian History* 22.2 (2003): 23-25.

Focuses on the influences of Catholicism on the life and works of Tolkien. Introduces *Silm* as a key to notice *LR*'s romantic and nostalgic elements of Catholicism, and explains good and evil in Middle-earth are based on Christian notions.

[87] Whittingham, Elizabeth Ann. "The Final Victory: The

Evolution of J. R. R. Tolkien's 'The History of Middle-earth'." Diss. State U of New York at Buffalo, 2002.

Generalizes Tolkien's works' evolution from the earliest stage of manuscripts in 1910s to his death, through the biographical facts and the development of Tolkien's texts, focusing on the cosmogony, theogony, metaphysics, and eschatology of his world. Concludes the most significant concept is his Christian faith. [DAI-A 63/08 (2003): 2884]

[88] Wood, Ralph C. "Good & Evil in Middle-earth." *Christian History* 22.2 (2003): 28-32.

Introduces *Silm* as a tool to understand the system of Good and Evil in Middle-earth that exemplified by the divine characters, Ilúvatar, Ainur, and the Satanic figure Melkor and his subordinates. Suggests that Melkor's disobedience and rebellion are the main motives for sin in Tolkien's writing, and the Fall caused by characters' pride are repeatedly appears through his works as an archetype of Evil.

## 6. Index

[A] Agøy: 21, 29

[B]Barkley: 29

Barnfield: 24

Beach: 24

Birzer: 41

Broadwell: 22

Burgess: 18

[C] Carpenter: 11

Chance: 39

Cooper: 40

Crabbe: 11

Crossley: 19

[D] De Anna: 25

Dodds: 26

Drout: 33

Duriez: 26

[E] Egan: 19

Egginton: 36

Ellison: 41

Elton: 17

Evans. J: 36

Evans. R: 21

[F] Flieger: 17, 20, 33, 40

Foster: 13

[G] Garbowski: 35

Gloge: 42

Gough: 28

Greenman: 22

[H] Hammond: 29

Hein: 34

Heinemann: 27

Helms: 13

Heydt: 39

Hostetter: 30

Houghton: 30

Howerd: 42

[I] Irigarey: 33

Isaacs: 14

[J] Johnson: 20

[K] Kilby: 11

Kocher: 14, 19, 37

[L] Lewis: 31

[M] Mathews: 13

Mende: 21

McLellan: 15

[N] Noad: 37

[O] O'brien: 24

[P] Pearce: 12

Provost: 23

Purtill: 17

[R] Rawls: 18

Rosebury: 25

[S] Sanford: 31

    Scull: 27

    Schweinicher: 32

    Senior: 38

    Shippey: 16, 28, 38

    Sly: 38

    St. Clair: 32

    Syme: 23

[T] Timmons: 35

    Tyler: 40

[V] Veith: 22

[W] West: 15

    Whittingham: 34, 42

    Wicher: 15

    Wood: 43